

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

Subject: Capital investment for Replacement of Minibuses
Committee: Cabinet
Date: 14 August 2012
Cabinet Member: Councillor Vincent
CMT Member: Anthony Payne, Director for Place
Author: Garry Stainer, Fleet and Garage Manager
Contact: Tel: 01752 304682
email: garry.stainer@plymouth.gov.uk
Ref:
Key Decision: No
Part: I

Purpose of the Report:

This report refers to Phase II of the Vehicle Replacement Programme. This phase relates to the purchase of 28 new minibuses of which the Council currently utilises for Adult Social Care and under statutory duty for Home to School Transport.

Details of the existing fleet of minibuses are provided in Appendix A, B and C. These separate the fleet between PCC users, academy users and schools. The lack of a rolling annual replacement program has meant many services are operating old and worn out fleet within these operations. The costs are incurred by the fleet and garage function within Environmental Services and recharged to end users. This situation is placing an increasing budget pressure on the departments involved: Adult Social Care, children's Education, Learning and Families, plus schools. It is also driving the need for 'spot hire' replacements whilst repairs are undertaken or to cover disposal items. The impact on front line service delivery is being affected and abortive time costs are increasing. Appendix E shows the cost per vehicle currently incurred whilst Appendix F (Part II Background Paper – Appendices) shows the cost benefit analysis for replacement, highlighting the current annual maintenance and hire costs at over £300k pa.

Of the 37 minibuses operated by PCC, 34 are owned by the Council and 3 are hired. Many of those that are hired are required on a long term basis by the services that use them but an inability to commit to their long term utilisation has led to a situation where they are frequently paid for on short term rates – which are more expensive. This situation has now become untenable. The cost benefit analysis in Appendix F (Part II Background Paper – Appendices), shows that the 7 year net present value benefit for purchasing replacement vehicles over maintaining the existing fleet is £661k.

A strategic approach has been taken to analyse the fleet and determine the most cost effective solution to resolving the current state of the vehicles. During the analysis an utilisation study identified that fleet consolidation could reduce the number of vehicles required from 37 to 28 (this represents a 25% saving). The first vehicles to be replaced will be those on expensive spot hire and old or expired lease arrangements.

A comparison between lease and purchase options has also been undertaken. The findings from this work were that outright purchase is the best option in reducing costs and increasing efficiencies. Appendix G shows the current leased and purchased minibuses and Appendix H shows the comparison and benefits of borrowing the capital at 3.5% for the Council to purchase the vehicles instead of leasing them on rates of up to 6.5%.

The replacement vehicles in this phase of the programme include 11 standard minibuses, 10 tail lift minibuses and 7 people carriers. These vehicles form the basis of this report and are to be phased in over a 2 year period. Appendix I describes the approach for each customer, including where consolidation of vehicles (from 37 to 28) will impact for the changes proposed, Appendix J shows the replacement programme over time and Appendix K lists the items and quantities for all the replacements.

This purchase is the start of an intended 8 year rolling program for fleet replacements. This will eradicate peaks and troughs and allow the financial pressures to be evened out over the 8 years. The fleet manager will also be able to better manage and sweat the assets where possible to gain even more efficiencies and savings.

The purchase represents an opportunity to put into practise the principles of a Cooperative Council by considering the needs not just of the Council but also those of the community and voluntary sector in the city to maximise the effectiveness of the spend and multi-agency utilisation of the vehicles. There are multiple options that could be used to take this work forward; a couple of options are outlined below.

Option 1 - This option would take the consolidated spend of PCC plus the community and voluntary sector on minibuses to a procurement process. The procurement would ask bidders to establish a hire company in Plymouth supporting these customers with costs subsidised by the capital that would otherwise be spent on purchasing the minibuses. This option would require delaying the purchase by an estimated 12 months whilst requirements are gathered and a complex procurement is undertaken. This delay is estimated to cost around £280k in additional maintenance and extra hire costs to PCC alone. Project management costs (assuming use of external resources) could be in the region of £200k.

Option 2 - The alternative is to proceed with the purchase based on the requirements from PCC and in parallel ascertain community group demand by using Community and Social Action Plymouth, the umbrella group for the community & voluntary sector and

other groups such as Access Plymouth. A purchase made by PCC would be conditional on making the vehicles available to community groups within the city. This would be done by completing an investigation into community requirements and once understood, a working group would be established reporting to the People directorate to open the way for community groups to utilise the assets in the city. Appendix D below shows the current service usage patterns for PCC users of the minibuses, which will be mapped to community requirements to determine the increase in utilisation that is possible. Appendix L describes the background and opportunity of this approach and the proposed next steps. This option would also leave open the possibility of future transfer of some or all of the minibuses bought by the Council to a community group in the future, for example the North of Plymouth Economic Development Trust.

Given the cost and potential delay associated with option 1, and the future flexibility of option 2, option 2 is recommended to Cabinet for approval.

A third option, that of finding another organisation that may make the purchase on behalf of the Council and hire them out to PCC. This option was discounted after investigating local suppliers of minibuses, unfortunately the vehicles PCC requires have specialist adaptations and suppliers do not have suitable capacity within their fleets to offer such a service. Therefore the purchase option is the only option that will ensure that our statutory requirements are met.

Corporate Plan 2012-2015:

To provide value for money for communities in delivering an efficient Service

Implications for Medium Term Financial Plan and Resource Implications: Including finance, human, IT and land

The replacement of minibus vehicles has a total estimated cost of £1.055m and will be incurred over the period 2013 – 15. These costs will be funded from unsupported borrowing, to be taken over 5 years, with the repayment charges being met from within the existing fleet revenue budgets. These costs will be recharged to end users; however, the overall charges to services are expected to fall due to the anticipated savings in maintenance, leasing and hire charges.

In addition, it is expected that service efficiencies can be gained through the use of more suitable, modern and reliable vehicles, resulting in further budget savings and improved service delivery. The 7 year NPV savings estimate resulting from this spend is expected to be £661k.

Other Implications: e.g. Child Poverty, Community Safety, Health and Safety, Risk Management and Equality, Diversity and Community Cohesion: Health and safety

- The risk of accidents and serious injury to the passengers and to staff is significantly reduced with newer more efficient vehicles especially with regards to the electric tail lifts.
 - Improvements and new vehicles will improve the service delivered to people with disabilities
 - Transfer of asset –The assets and liability can be transferred and will be under -written within a formal contracts at the time of transfer to any School trust or Academy.
-

Recommendations & Reasons for recommended action:

1. Cabinet approve the outright purchase of the vehicles and plant items
2. That Cabinet recommend to the Full Council to add this project to the Place Capital Programme 2013 - 15

Following the replacement programme the anticipated benefits are as follows:

- Eliminate short-term hire costs
 - Reduce the instances of breakdowns and maintain service delivery
 - To have vehicles that would be more suitable for consolidation thus assisting the reduction of 9 vehicles.
-

Alternative options considered and reasons for recommended action:

Do nothing

To do nothing would result in further cost increases and potentially significant disruption to services due to the increasing need to maintain the vehicles. This would also increase the Health and Safety risk of staff and public utilising these vehicles.

Purchase or lease/hire vehicles

A comparison between purchase and hire costs for minibuses has been carried out, the results of which show that the purchasing option offers better value for money.

Background papers:

Part II Cabinet Paper

Sign off:

Fin AF	SG/Pla ceFes c1213 003.0 2.08.1 2	Leg	1517 6. SC	HR	N/A	Corp Prop	N/A	IT	N/A	Strat Proc	286 JK
Originating SMT Member ; Jayne Donovan, Assistant Director for Environmental Services											
Have you consulted the Cabinet Member(s) named on the report? Yes											

I. Brief Description

This business case follows on from the CPAF (Capital Programme Approval Form) that was approved in July 2011 for the Vehicle and Plant Replacement Programme. The subject of that CPAF was Phase 1 – Refuse Collection Vehicles. The CPAF also made reference to phases 2 to 4:

Phase 2 – Minibuses (CYP, ASC and School Services)

Phase 3 – Plant and Equipment (Street Cleansing and Parks)

Phase 4 – Other dilapidated or expensive vehicles (various services)

The subject of this business case is Phase 2 – Minibuses. The Council's current use for minibuses is by Children's Social Care, Adult Social Care and Schools.

2. Project Details

The Environmental Services Business Plan 2011-14 identified the area faced major challenges, with significant capital investment required in vehicles and plant.

The outline plan for delivering priorities identified a Council/city priority: provide value for communities through Environmental Services Transformation with major investment in new vehicles and plant.

The Council utilises approximately 59 minibuses which are in various states of condition and age and have been obtained by purchasing, leasing, hiring or as gifts.

The current profile of the minibuses has been detailed in Appendix A.

There are a further five minibuses that have been identified but will not be included within this paper as they are used by the following academies; Coombe Dean School, Heles School and Lipson Community College. Please see Appendix B.

Furthermore, those minibuses currently used by schools or other organisations where the budgets are outside the control of the Council will not be included as part of the replacement programme, these are; Egguckland Community College, Notre Dame RC School, Pembroke Street EMB, Sir John Hunt Community College, St Pauls RC Primary School and Tor Bridge High. Please see Appendix C.

A review of the current usage of minibuses has been carried out and provided at Appendix D. The majority of the buses are used every day for daily activities. Only a few minibuses are used evening and weekends and summer clubs, few are used for residential trips.

3. Options Appraisal

It is a legal requirement that minibuses are serviced eight times a year, which is every 13 weeks. Due to the ageing profile of the current minibus fleet, servicing and maintenance costs are increasing year on year.

A breakdown of individual costs per vehicle has been provided at Appendix E. The fixed fees for the fleet reflect the purchase/lease/hire costs.

For the period 01/04/11-31/03/12 (pro-rated for service and maintenance costs)

Yearly charge (Insurance and fixed fee): £242,590

Service and maintenance costs: £88,256

Annual cost for the minibus fleet: £330,846

These are not the full service and maintenance costs for the minibus fleet, this is only the information that is available for 26 vehicles. Hired vehicles are maintained through the hire contracts. Some schools use Citybus; with others it is not clear who they use to service and maintain their vehicles.

The preferred option is to purchase minibuses. A cost benefit analysis has been completed and can be found at Appendix F (Part II Background Papers – Appendices).

Following the replacement programme the anticipated benefits are as follows:

- Eliminate short-term hire costs
- Eliminate long-term leasing arrangements
- Improve service delivery
- Improve turnaround times for servicing within the garage
- Reduce licensing costs where possible by purchasing vehicles under 3.5T
- Reduce the instances of breakdowns and maintain service delivery

4. Affordability

The current fleet profile contains a large number of leased vehicles. From the comparisons undertaken in August 2010 and August 2011 by Sector, the option to purchase vehicles has shown to provide more value for money over leasing. Both of these options are better value for money over long-term hire.

The cost of leasing these vehicles has declined over the years, so comparison between current lease costs and purchase costs would not give an accurate view. This is due to the long period of the leases and the decline in costs. But, taken into consideration with escalating servicing and maintenance costs the case for renewing vehicles is strong. This is further supported by the number of vehicles which have a high incidence of breakdown and unreliability; breakdowns seriously interrupt the provision of services, which leads to delays, customer complaints and higher costs. The garage are also experiencing problems with replacement parts for LDV since they went into receivership, causing further delays.

A summary of the current position with regards to leased and purchased minibuses has been provided at Appendix G.

Please see Appendix H with regards to the costs between alternative options such as borrowing and leasing. The rates used are as follows:

Borrowing 3.5%

Finance lease 6.5%

Leasing long-term 5%

The preferred option would be to replace old leased vehicles as the leases have now ended, also purchased and hire vehicles with new purchased vehicles. We would be looking to replace 28 vehicles and reduce the number of vehicles in the fleet through consolidation from 37 vehicles.

The current profile is:

- 13 standard minibuses
- 18 tail lift minibuses
- 6 people carriers

The new profile will be:

- 11 standard minibuses
- 10 tail lift minibuses
- 7 people carriers

A summary of the changes to the minibus usage since the original data collection and suggested replacements has been provided at Appendix I and a breakdown of the replacement programme has been provided at Appendix J. Those areas considered within this business case using minibuses were consulted and have had an opportunity to review the business case and have provided comments and feedback.

The full list of items to be purchased is listed at Appendix K.

Year 1 replacements include vehicles currently on short-term hire and vehicles on long-term lease over 10 years old, also included are vehicles over seven years old and Year 2 replacements include the remaining vehicles.

A phased approach has been proposed to allow the spread of the capital cost over a period of 2 years and to enable the garage to manage the implementation of the new vehicles. Those vehicles which would not be replaced until Year 2, would continue to attract a leasing, servicing and maintenance cost.

5. Achievability

The risks to this project are with regards to the Council being unable to identify the capital monies to pay for the minibus replacement programme. Leasing would then need to be considered. This is not the preferred option, but is preferable to hire. Consideration would need to be given to:

- Finance leases 3% more expensive but we own the asset.
- Long term operating lease 5% more expensive – we do not own the asset – (high risk and opt out clauses)

This would increase the pressure on the service areas and garage to maintain the existing fleet, to identify further revenue to pay for higher hire charges, to risk service delivery and service user satisfaction.

APPENDICES FOR PHASE 2 – MINIBUSES

Appendix A – Current profile of minibuses

Location	Service type	Type of vehicle	Purchased/leased/hired	Registration	Current mileage (miles)
ACE Service	School	People carrier	Leased	59 (2009)	Unknown
		People carrier	Leased	59 (2009)	Unknown
		Standard minibus	Leased	08 (2008)	Unknown
		Standard minibus	Purchased	09 (2009)	Unknown
Fleet	Garage (spares)	Tail lift minibus	Leased	V (1999)	87268
		Standard minibus	Leased	V (1999)	97352
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	V (1999)	70301
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	V (1999)	118861
Home to school transport	Education/special needs	Tail lift minibus	Leased	V (1999)	103538
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	W (2000)	68295
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	05 (2005)	165000
		Standard minibus	Purchased	54 (2004)	46685
H to S transport / Brook Green Centre for Learning	Special needs	Standard minibus	Leased	V (1999)	167000 km
H to S transport / Courtlands School	School – moderate learning difficulties	Standard minibus	Leased	51 (2001)	78000
H to S transport / Downham School	School – special needs (disability)	Tail lift minibus	Leased	V (1999)	108000
H to S transport / Longcause School	School – special needs	Standard minibus	Leased	V (1999)	159000
H to S transport / Millford School	School – learning difficulties	Tail lift minibus	Leased	W (2000)	85000
H to S transport / Millford School	School – learning difficulties	Standard minibus	Leased	53 (2003)	144767
H to S transport / Mount Tamar School	School – emotional behavioural difficulties	Standard minibus	Leased	V (1999)	166000 km
H to S transport / Woodlands	School – physical disabilities	Tail lift minibus	Purchased	54 (2004)	83000

Longcause School	School – special needs	Standard minibus	Purchased	X (2000)	46046
Mount Tamar School	School – emotional behavioural difficulties	People carrier	Hired	10 (2010)	Hired
Reatch Centre	Adult Social Care – physical disability & sensory impairment	People carrier	Purchased	56 (2006)	40059
		People carrier	Purchased	56 (2006)	37000
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	W (2000)	144640
		Tail lift minibus	Purchased	54 (2004)	116397
St George's CRC	Adult Social Care – learning difficulties, some sensory impairment	Standard minibus	Purchased	54 (2004)	57909
		Minibus with ramp	Purchased	52 (2002)	149603
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	X (2000)	89077
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	Y (2001)	77444
Woodfield	Adult Social Care – physical & learning difficulties	Standard minibus	Hired	60 (2010)	Hired
		People carrier	Hired	59 (2009)	Hired
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	W (2000)	76816
		Tail lift minibus	Purchased	05 (2005)	70106
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	05 (2005)	95613
		Tail lift minibus	Leased	02 (2002)	63270

Appendix B – Minibuses used by Academies

Location	Service type	Type of vehicle	Purchased/leased/hired	Registration
Coombe Dean School	Academy	Standard minibus	Purchased	R (1997)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	R (1997)

Heles School	Academy	Standard minibus	Purchased	J (1991)
Lipson Community College	Academy	Standard minibus	Purchased	57 (2007)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	T (1999)

Appendix C – Minibuses used by Schools

Location	Service type	Type of vehicle	Purchased/leased/hired	Registration
Eggbuckland Community College	School	Standard minibus	Leased	09 (2009)
		Standard minibus	Leased	09 (2009)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	M (1994)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	P (1996)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	54 (2004)
Notre Dame RC school	School	Standard minibus	Purchased	57 (2007)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	02 (2002)
Pembroke Street EMB		Standard minibus	Purchased	09 (2009)
Sir John Hunt Community College	School	Standard minibus	Purchased	52 (2002)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	55 (2005)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	52 (2002)
St Pauls RC Primary School	School	Standard minibus	Purchased	05 (2005)
Tor Bridge High	School	Standard minibus	Purchased	K (1992)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	WV (2000)
		Standard minibus	Purchased	04 (2004)

Appendix D - Service usage

ACE Service

This service uses minibuses for activities during the day such as martial arts, walks on Dartmoor and other physical activities such as football. There is no requirement for evening, holiday or weekend usage.

Home to School Transport

These minibuses are used to provide a legal statutory duty to provide transport to and from school for certain pupils. These vehicles are required to take children with special educational needs to and from Special Schools.

There is an arrangement with the schools that they have use of the minibuses through the day for which an annual charge is made. This offsets the home to school transport costs and is also a cost effective way of having a minibus available to the schools, rather than them hiring in private vehicles and drivers.

Home to school transport only – The vehicles are used between the hours of 7.00 to 10.00am and 14.15 to 17.30pm, driver and passenger assistants provided by the home to school transport team.

Home to School transport and Brook Green – Vehicle is used between 7.00am to 17.30pm and for activities every day, which include two days for college use, vocational activities and school trips. They hire a driver for vocational activities or school trips. There is no requirement for evening use, but can be used during holiday periods for trips. There are three staff members able to drive this minibus and staff are also used as passenger assistants, the vehicle stays on the premises overnight.

Home to School transport and Courtlands School - Vehicle is used between 7.00am to 17.30pm and for various vocational activities during the day. They hire a minibus and driver on occasion for conflicting activities. There is no requirement for evening use or holiday periods. There are seven staff members able to drive this minibus and staff are also used as passenger assistants, the vehicle stays on the premises overnight.

Home to School transport and Downham School - Vehicle is used between 7.00am to 17.30pm and for various activities during the day. They hire a minibus and driver on occasion for residential trips and conflicting activities. There is no requirement for evening use or holiday periods. In January three members of staff were planning to take their driver's test to allow them to drive this vehicle, staff members are used for passenger assistants.

Home to School transport and Longcause School - Vehicle is used between 7.00am to 17.30pm and for various activities during the day. There is no requirement for evening use or holiday periods. One teacher and two teaching assistants accompany students on trips out. The vehicle is left on site overnight during school holidays the vehicle is returned to Prince Rock.

Home to School transport and Milford School - Vehicles are used between 7.00am to 17.30pm and for activities every day. There is no requirement for evening use or school holidays. They use two passenger assistants and the drivers are provided by the home to school transport team, approximately 11 staff are able to drive the bus for daily activities.

Home to School transport and Mount Tamar School –This bus is used between 7.00am to 17.30pm and for various activities during the day. This school is linked to satellite sites at Oakridge Primary at Southway and Seymour House in Mount Wise. The minibus is used in the evenings for students at the hostel for trips out and only started being used during the holidays last year for the holiday club. The minibus is left on site overnight; six staff are able to drive the minibus.

Home to School transport and Woodlands School - Vehicle is used between 7.00am to 17.30pm and for various activities during the day. The minibus is used daily by the school and is constantly used during evenings, weekends and holidays by Wood View Short Break Service (SBS). The service is open 50 weeks a year, 7 days a week, 24 hours a day. SBS have 4 trained drivers and Woodlands have 6 trained drivers. All can drive vehicles over 3.5 tons.

Longcause School and Mount Tamar School

See above for indication of usage.

Reatch Centre

The Vehicles are used between 8.15am to 17.00pm, the vehicles are used for two collection and drop off runs morning and afternoon and activities during the day, every day. One people carrier is made available to Colwill Lodge for evening use. Two vehicles stay overnight at Windsor House and the other at Prince Rock; no vehicle is left on site due to security issues.

St Georges CRC

Vehicles are used between 9.00 to 10.30am and 15.00 to 16.30pm to collect and drop off service users between their home and the centre and for activities during the day, every day. There is no requirement for evening or weekend use. Passenger assistants required are dependent upon service user needs; they tend to support service users on a 1:1 basis using public transport wherever possible.

Woodfield

Vehicles are used between 8.45 to 10.30am and 3.30 to 4.45pm for home to centre runs and for activities through the day, every day. Both people carriers are for the use of one service user each for activities through the day. All trips have passenger assistants; drivers are day support workers (staff). The vehicles are not kept on site overnight; one is left at Prince Rock, one at school in Plympton for the Plympton/Plymstock run and one at Colwill Lodge for evening use. Staff also use their own vehicles for daytime activities. No requirement by the centre for evening or weekend use.

Appendix E – Costs per vehicle											
Registration No.	Make / Model	Style	Department	Service	Acquisition Method	Start Date	Insurance Premium (monthly)	Fixed Charge (monthly)	Yearly charge	Service and maintenance cost 01/04/11-31/03/12	Annual cost per vehicle
LD59 YRT	Peugeot Tepee 1.6, 9 seater	People carrier	ACE Service, Palace Court	School	Leased	01/01/2009	76.25	298.12	4,492.44	0.00	4,492.44
LD59 YRU	Peugeot Tepee 1.6, 9 seater	People carrier	ACE Service, Palace Court	School	Leased	01/01/2009	76.25	298.12	4,492.44	0.00	4,492.44
WJ08XDM	Ford Transit 2.4 TDCI 115ps LWB 15 Seater Minibus	Mini Bus	ACE Service, Palace Court	School	Leased	01/03/2008	76.25	323.77	4,800.24	0.00	4,800.24
WJ09 XPZ	Ford Transit 2400cc	Mini Bus	ACE Service, Palace Court	School	Purchased		76.25		915.00	0.00	915.00
V912ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Fleet hire income	Spare	Leased	18/11/1999	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	4,472.01	14,006.49
V924ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 3.5 HI LOAD BUS	Mini Bus	Fleet hire income	Spare	Leased	01/11/1999	76.25	339.25	4,986.00	1,225.60	6,211.60
V914ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Fleet Repairs	Spare	Leased	07/12/1999	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	4,005.16	13,539.64

V488EDV	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Fleet Repairs	Spare	Leased	08/11/ 1999	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	2,333.81	11,868.29
VI80LFJ	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT (Girling's Coaches)	Mini Bus	Home to School transport	Education / special needs	Leased	14/02/ 2000	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	0.00	9,534.48
V926ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 3.5 HI LOAD BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport	Education / special needs	Leased	08/11/ 1999	76.25	339.25	4,986.00	2,392.73	7,378.73
W276TFJ	LEYLAND DAF 400 SERIES TD BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	home to school transport	Education / special needs	Leased	01/04/ 2000	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	4,924.24	14,458.72
WA05FFN	LDV 400 SERIES TD 3.5T BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	home to school transport	Education / special needs	Leased	27/06/ 2005	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	3,387.51	12,921.99
WA54GVZ	LDV CONVOY 3.85T BUS	Mini Bus	home to school transport	Education / special needs	Purchased	29/11/ 2004	76.25	339.25	4,986.00	3,450.38	8,436.38
V927ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY Hi LOAD BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Brook Green Centre for Learning	Special needs	Leased	01/12/ 1999	51.04	339.25	4,683.48	2,400.00	7,083.48

WA51YXD	LDV CONVOY HI-LOADER BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Courtlands School	Moderate learning difficulties	Leased	26/02/2002	76.25	339.25	4,986.00	2,792.95	7,778.95
V489EDV	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Downham School	Special needs	Leased	08/11/1999	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	3,413.17	12,947.65
V925ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 3.5 HI LOAD BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Longcause School	Special needs and/or disabilities	Leased	01/11/1999	76.25	339.25	4,986.00	6,790.42	11,776.42
W278TFJ	LEYLAND DAF 400 SERIES TD BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Millford School	Learning difficulties school	Leased	03/05/2000	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	3,987.14	13,521.62
WA53DPO	LDV CONVOY 3.85T BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Millford School	Learning difficulties school	Leased	04/02/2004	76.25	339.25	4,986.00	2,661.23	7,647.23

WA54GXX (No longer available to Woodlands)	WESSEX LDV CONVOY 4.1T XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Woodlands	Physical disabilities	Purchased	29/01/2005	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	0.00	9,534.48
X774BDV	LDV 400 SERIES TD 3.5T BUS	Mini Bus	Longcause School	Special needs and/or disabilities	Purchased		76.25		915.00	284.18	1,199.18
ND10VZR	FORD GALAXY	People carrier	Mount Tamar School	Emotional behavioural difficulties	Hired (Northgate)	01/09/2011	76.25	504	6,963.00	0.00	6,963.00
GP56XEJ	PEUGEOT EXPERT 815D	People carrier	REATCH	Physical disability and sensory impairment (adults)	Purchased	21/02/2007	76.25	0	915.00	1,739.16	2,654.16
GP56XEO	PEUGOT EXPERT 815D(BUS)	People carrier	REATCH	Physical disability and sensory impairment (adults)	Purchased	21/02/2007	76.25	0	915.00	990.92	1,905.92
W274TFJ	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 4.1T XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	REATCH	Physical disability and sensory impairment (adults)	Leased	23/03/2000	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	5,757.13	15,291.61

WA54AGO	WESSEX LDV CONVOY 4.IT XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	REATCH	Physical disability and sensory impairment (adults)	Purchased	15/12/ 2004	76.25	339.25	4,986.00	6,299.25	11,285.25
WA54GWN	LDV CONVOY 3.85T BUS	Mini Bus	S Georges CRC	Learning difficulties, some sensory and physical disabilities (adults)	Purchased	29/11/ 2004	76.25	339.25	4,986.00	1,764.48	6,750.48
WK52LZB	MERCEDES VITO 110 CDI / SPECIALITY FITTED	Mini Bus	S Georges CRC	Learning difficulties, some sensory and physical disabilities (adults)	Purchased	24/01/ 2003	77	291.63	4,423.56	3,180.72	7,604.28
X863CTA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 4.IT BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	S Georges CRC	Learning difficulties, some sensory and physical disabilities (adults)	Leased	01/02/ 2001	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	2,024.07	11,558.55
Y304GFJ	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 4.IT BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	S Georges CRC	Learning difficulties, some	Leased	02/04/ 2001	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	4,813.66	14,348.14

				sensory and physical disabilities (adults)							
DK60 SSO	Standard Minibus	Mini Bus	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Hired (SHB Hire)	06/12/2010	76.25	650	8,715.00	0.00	8,715.00
NJ59 OOX	FORD GALAXY	People carrier	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Hired (Northgate)	25/09/2009	76.25	660	8,835.00	0.00	8,835.00
W277TFJ (Taken out of service, replaced with NLI0HUH)	LEYLAND DAF 400 SERIES TD BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus (replaced with people carrier)	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Leased	06/04/2000	76.25	718.29	8,619.48	0.00	8,619.48
WA05FDM	LDV 400 SERIES TD 3.5T BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Purchased	15/04/2005	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	5,044.66	14,579.14

WA05FFJ	LDV 400 SERIES TD 3.5T BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Leased	13/05/ 2005	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	4,777.51	14,311.99
WJ02JAO	LDV CONVOY 4.IT BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Leased	29/04/ 2002	76.25	718.29	9,534.48	3,344.28	12,878.76
									242,589.84	88,256.38	330,846.22

Appendix G – Summary of current leased and purchased minibuses

All leased vehicles have reached the end of the original lease contracts. A summary has been provided below:

- 8 vehicles with leases over 13 years
- 5 vehicles with leases over 12 years
- 2 vehicles with leases over 11 years
- 2 vehicles with leases over 10 years
- 3 vehicles with leases over 7 years
- 3 vehicles with leases under 4 years

With the vehicles which have been purchased the age profile is as follows:

- 7 vehicles over 7 years of age
- 2 vehicles over 5 years of age
- 1 vehicle 3 years of age

Appendix H - Comparator between borrowing and leasing options

	Minibuses £1,055,000		
	%	Annual (£)	Total over 5 yrs (£)
Borrowing	3.5	230,307.48	1,151,537.40
Finance lease	6.5	247,707.48	1,238,537.40
Leasing long-term	5.0	238,909.80	1,194,549.00

Appendix I – Summary of changes and replacements

ACE Service

This service currently runs two people carriers and two minibuses. We would recommend terminating the leases and purchasing two people carriers and one minibus.

Garage (spares)

There are currently four minibuses leased, from the Council owned tail lift minibuses which would be replaced we recommend keeping two of these minibuses as spares and keeping one Council owned standard minibus as spare.

Home to School Transport

Since the data collection the service has had some changes to their operation. The service currently uses three tail lift minibuses and two standard minibuses just for transporting children from home to school. We are investigating the option to incorporate this requirement into the Minibus and Coach Contract which was let in 2011. Prices have been received and reviewed from the two operators; both can meet the Council's requirement for this service requirement and would be ready to commence the new service from September 2012. It is the intention of the Home to School Transport team to incorporate these routes into the current Minibus and Coach Contract.

The home to school transport team also use four standard minibuses and three tail lift minibuses to transport children from home to school and then are left on site for each school to use. We are recommending the option that these minibuses are replaced with equivalent vehicles and consideration given to the service being incorporated into each school and supported by each school. This would entail each school taking over the home to school transport run.

Longcause School

This school currently has the use of a standard minibus. The recommendation is to replace this vehicle with equivalent.

Mount Tamar School

Further to obtaining data about this School's usage of the minibus, they have since been gifted by a charity with a brand new 17 seater standard minibus in December 2011. Therefore they no longer use the minibus provided by the home to transport team. Mount Tamar also currently hires in one people carrier for their requirements, the recommended option would be to purchase a people carrier to replace the one currently hired.

Reatch Centre

The Centre currently uses two people carriers and two tail lift minibuses. The recommended option is equivalent replacements.

St George CRC

The Centre currently uses one standard, two tail lift and one minibus with ramp. The recommended option is to replace the standard minibus, replace the two tail lifts with one tail lift and a standard minibus the minibus with ramp should be a standard minibus or a minibus with ramp.

Woodfield

Since the data collection, the situation with regards to vehicles has changed from one people carrier, one standard minibus and four tail lift minibuses. One of the tail lift minibuses has been taken out of service and replaced with a hired people carrier. The Centre currently uses two hired people carriers, three tail lift minibuses and one hired standard minibus, the recommended option is to purchase equivalent replacements.

Woodlands School

Since the data collection, Woodlands have lost the use of the home to school minibus which used to be available to them during the day. They have identified a further need to have another tail lift minibus, in addition to that replaced via the home to transport data above as their classes include more than five wheelchair users.

Appendix J - Replacement programme									
Registration No.	Make / Model	Style	Department	Service	Acquisition Method	Start Date	Replacement Year 1 2013- 14	Replacement Year 2 2014- 5	
LD59 YRT	Peugeot Tepee 1.6, 9 seater	People carrier	ACE Service, Palace Court	School	Leased	01/01/2009		People carrier	
LD59 YRU	Peugeot Tepee 1.6, 9 seater	People carrier	ACE Service, Palace Court	School	Leased	01/01/2009		People carrier	
WJ08XDM	Ford Transit 2.4 TDCI 115ps LWB 15 Seater Minibus	Mini Bus	ACE Service, Palace Court	School	Leased	01/03/2008		Standard minibus	
WJ09 XPZ	Ford Transit 2400cc	Mini Bus	ACE Service, Palace Court	School	Purchased			Standard minibus	
V912ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Fleet hire income	Spare	Leased	18/11/1999	Use WA54GVZ to replace as spare		
V924ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 3.5 HI LOAD BUS	Mini Bus	Fleet hire income	Spare	Leased	01/11/1999	Use WA54GWN to replace as spare	Use WJ09XPZ to replace WA54GWN	
V914ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Fleet Repairs	Spare	Leased	07/12/1999	Use WA05FDM to replace as spare		

V488EDV	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Home to School transport	Spare	Leased	08/11/1999	No replacement		
V180LFJ	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT (Girlings Coaches)	Mini Bus	Home to School transport	Education / special needs	Leased	14/02/2000	Incorporate usage into current contract		
V926ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 3.5 HI LOAD BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport	Education / special needs	Leased	08/11/1999	Incorporate usage into current contract		
W276TFJ	LEYLAND DAF 400 SERIES TD BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	home to school transport	Education / special needs	Leased	01/04/2000	Incorporate usage into current contract		
WA05FFN	LDV 400 SERIES TD 3.5T BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	home to school transport	Education / special needs	Leased	27/06/2005	Incorporate usage into current contract		

WA54GVZ	LDV CONVOY 3.85T BUS	Mini Bus	home to school transport	Education / special needs	Purchased	29/11/2004	Incorporate usage into current contract (then minibus will be used as garage spare)		
V927ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY Hi LOAD BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Brook Green Centre for Learning	Special needs	Leased	01/12/1999	Standard minibus		
WA51YXD	LDV CONVOY HI-LOADER BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Courtlands School	Moderate learning difficulties	Leased	26/02/2002	Standard minibus		
V489EDV	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Downham School	Special needs	Leased	08/11/1999	Tail lift minibus		
V925ETA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 3.5 HI LOAD BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Longcause School	Special needs and/or disabilities	Leased	01/11/1999	Standard minibus		
W278TFJ	LEYLAND DAF 400 SERIES TD BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Millford School	Learning difficulties school	Leased	03/05/2000	Tail lift minibus		
WA53DPO	LDV CONVOY 3.85T BUS	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Millford School	Learning difficulties school	Leased	04/02/2004	Standard minibus		

WA54GXX (No longer available to Woodlands)	WESSEX LDV CONVOY 4.IT XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Home to school transport / Woodlands	Physical disabilities	Purchased	29/01/2005	Tail lift minibus		
X774BDV	LDV 400 SERIES TD 3.5T BUS	Mini Bus	Longcause School	Special needs and/or disabilities	Purchased		Standard minibus		
ND10VZR	FORD GALAXY	People carrier	Mount Tamar School	Emotional behavioural difficulties	Hired (Northgate)	01/09/2011	People carrier		
GP56XEJ	PEUGEOT EXPERT 815D	People carrier	REATCH	Physical disability and sensory impairment (adults)	Purchased	21/02/2007		People carrier	
GP56XEO	PEUGOT EXPERT 815D(BUS)	People carrier	REATCH	Physical disability and sensory impairment (adults)	Purchased	21/02/2007		People carrier	
W274TFJ	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 4.IT XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	REATCH	Physical disability and sensory impairment (adults)	Leased	23/03/2000	Tail lift minibus		
WA54AGO	WESSEX LDV CONVOY 4.IT XLWB BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	REATCH	Physical disability and sensory impairment (adults)	Purchased	15/12/2004	Tail lift minibus		

WA54GWN	LDV CONVOY 3.85T BUS	Mini Bus	S Georges CRC	Learning difficulties, some sensory and physical disabilities (adults)	Purchased	29/11/2004	Standard minibus		
WK52LZB	MERCEDES VITO 110 CDI / SPECIALITY FITTED	Mini Bus	S Georges CRC	Learning difficulties, some sensory and physical disabilities (adults)	Purchased	24/01/2003	Ramped minibus		
X863CTA	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 4.1T BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	S Georges CRC	Learning difficulties, some sensory and physical disabilities (adults)	Leased	01/02/2001	Tail lift minibus		
Y304GFJ	LEYLAND DAF CONVOY 4.1T BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	S Georges CRC	Learning difficulties, some sensory and physical disabilities (adults)	Leased	02/04/2001	Standard minibus		
DK60 SSO	Standard Minibus	Mini Bus	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Hired (SHB Hire)	06/12/2010	Standard minibus		
NJ59 OOX	FORD GALAXY	People carrier	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Hired (Northgate)	25/09/2009	People carrier		

W277TFJ (Taken out of service, replaced with NLI0HUH)	LEYLAND DAF 400 SERIES TD BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus (replaced with people carrier)	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Leased	06/04/2000	People carrier		
WA05FDM	LDV 400 SERIES TD 3.5T BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Purchased	15/04/2005	Tail lift minibus (current minibus will then be used as garage spare)		
WA05FFJ	LDV 400 SERIES TD 3.5T BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Leased	13/05/2005	Tail lift minibus		
WJ02JAO	LDV CONVOY 4.IT BUS T/LIFT	Mini Bus	Woodfield	Physical and learning difficulties (adults)	Leased	29/04/2002	Tail lift minibus		
			Woodlands School	Physical disabilities			Tail lift minibus		

Appendix K – Replacement items and quantity

	2013/14 (Year 1)	2014/15 (Year 2)	2015/16 (Year 3)	2016/17 (Year 4)	Total
Standard minibus	9	2			11
Tail lift minibus	10	0			10
People carrier	3	4			7
Total	22	6			28

Appendix L – Cooperative approach to minibus usage

Co-operative Council Model

The Council has very clear aspirations to become a Co-operative Council, putting people in control of their own communities and the services they receive, as well as council staff having a stronger stake in delivery. It is about working together for the common good. The aim of the

Co-operative Council is to create a strong sense of togetherness and ownership of council supported services, amenities and assets, so that they can be more effectively and efficiently used and support the delivery of the city's vision and growth agenda.

Background

The Council has a fleet of approximately 59 minibuses. Many of these are managed and run directly by individual schools. However, the Council needs 28 minibuses that are managed and run by individual services providing vital transport, mainly Adult Social Care and Children's Services. We have a range of sizes from people carriers to 17 seater's, as well as vehicles with tail lifts and other special adaptations. These minibuses are now on their last legs and are in urgent need of replacing, at a cost of well over £1m.

Many of the vehicles are predominantly used between 9am and 5pm Monday to Friday and most evenings and weekends are parked up, not being used.

It would be fantastic if charities, volunteer groups and others based in the community who cannot afford their own minibus could have access in some way to this valuable asset. We need to understand how much more they could achieve and how much more people's quality of life could improve.

At Team Plymouth held on 20 June 2012 officers discussed opportunities, barriers to progress and the contribution that Departments might make and the benefits to both the community and the council regarding the use of mini buses by the community. The

information was collected and analysed and is grouped together under four headings below:

Opportunities

- Best use of assets, clear demand as currently only partially used.
- Opportunity to reach the most disengaged communities, ability for foster carers to take children out for the day – trips to moors, beaches etc.
- Provide training to volunteer drivers.
- Provide advice and guidance to access funding, i.e. Big Lottery.
- Facilitate networking with key organisations, i.e. Plymouth University.
- Understand current demand
- What is currently operating in the Council?
- Use of community volunteers to drive for PCC use, but provide use of minibus to the community in return.
- Better value.
- Support green initiatives by reducing car parking at community events/activities.
- Community/third sector able to extend/improve/expand their services.
- Draw links to new terms and conditions of operating, e.g. weekends, after hours.
- Possibility of income generation.
- Community involvement in running the minibus service through a co-operative.
- Reflecting on the Localism Act could extend community assets register to include vehicles.

Potential Barriers to Progress

- Issues regarding maintenance/ cost/insurance/fuel etc.
- Groups may not anticipate full cost and may not be able to meet costs.
- Need to relax some of the rules around who can drive buses and for what purposes (i.e. allow adaptation of a possible volunteer driver scheme).
- Will groups themselves be resistant – will they want such a close relationship – will they see it as causing more work for them?
- Some specialist vehicles or adapted vehicles may need to be exempt/protected.
- May not be the take up we envisage.
- What might be the impact on our profile and reputation if the minibuses are put to 'inappropriate' uses?
- How would access to the asset be managed?

- How would we prioritise use of vehicles? Schools could be granted priority over use of minibuses.

Departmental Contributions

- Help to 'sell the idea' – ensuring all potential customers are aware that a scheme may be available.
- Scope potential customers/community groups to assess interest.
- Can 'broker' between communities and schools assisting good working relations.
- Assist in providing 'out of school activities'.
- Offer 'Access Plymouth' opportunity to run 'ring 'n' ride'.
- Provide procurement knowledge and support.
- Provide risk management and health and safety knowledge and support.
- Can offer insurance advice, support and services.
- Can offer maintenance advice, support and/or services.
- Can provide driver training.
- Can provide administration support and/or administrative advice.
- Can offer advice on appropriate usage and even suggest alternative uses (e.g. hospital visits, tourism).
- Could arrange a trial or pilot run.
- Could bring in other partners and agencies (e.g. probation, parks services, wildlife trusts) using our networks.
- Could arrange trips to various PCC sites.

Benefits

- Community ownership
- Improved attendance, if minibuses could be used to pick up pupils where attendance is low.
- Improved education if attendance improves.
- Improvement in life chances – trips to beach, moors and other visits.
- Different operating models.
- Retain ownership and management.
- Retain ownership, management by social enterprise/co-op
- Social enterprise/co-op receives assets but SLA provides access to PCC.

Next steps

- Initially ascertain demand by using Community and Social Action Plymouth, the umbrella group for the community & voluntary sector. PCC could work with them to undertake a consultation with its members as a starting point.
- Set up a Task and Finish group to evaluate the outcome of the consultation and formulate all necessary work to be undertaken base on the level of demand, allocating tasks and timelines in order that a further report can be prepared in a timely manner.